eduGAIN policy comments

6nd Sep, 2010

www.edugain.org/policy

Initials	Commentator's name and contacts	In which role you have provided the comments
AS	Andreas Solberg	Comments from me personally. Not neccessarily representing UNINETT as an edugain member.
DL	Diego Lopez diego.lopez@rediris.es	
GW	Glenn Wearen (glenn.wearen@heanet.ie)	As federation operator of Edugate
NH	Nicole Harris. nicole.harris@jiscadvance.ac.uk, +44 (0)20 3006 6040.	On behalf of JISC and the UK federation.
SC	Scott Cantor (cantor.2@osu.edu)	Non-European, Shibboleth developer, shepherd of relevant standards and profiles
TL	Thomas Lenggenhager	
TW	Torbjörn Wiberg torbjorn.wiberg@adm.umu.se	Involved in policy decisions for SWAMID

Type: ge=general, te=technical, ed=editorial

Attribute Profile (ATTR)

Id	Who	Line	Type	Comment (justification for change)	Proposed change by the commentator	Discussion in the policy subtask	Resolution by the policy subtask
1	AS	716	ge	No reference to MACE-dir profiles.		Add that MACE-Dir SAML Attribute Profiles, April 2008 MUST be followed	Attributes defined in eduPerson [eduPerson] and SCHAC [SCHAC] MAY be used in eduGAIN.
2	TL	723	ed		Refr to SCHAC, not Schac and include proper references to the original web sites.	Add reference to schemas	See ATTR-1
3	SC	735	ge	Attributes here are referenced informally by shortname.	Attributes should be referenced only through formal reference to a source of authority for the attribute type/definition. Could be eduPerson, could be another schema, could be an RFC, etc. Also FWIW, I'd dump CN as an attribute in favor of displayName.	ok, change that	See ATTR-1 and table in section 1.1
4	DL	735	ge	In the question about "common name" and "display name" I see no harm in recommendig both. CN is the most applications would use to identify an individual (as per			Recommend both cn and DisplayName

Type: ge=general, te=technical, ed=editorial

Id	Who	Line	Type	Comment (justification for change)	Proposed change by the commentator	Discussion in the policy subtask	Resolution by the policy subtask
				logging purposes and individual access rights, for example) and therefore subject to certain common standards in what relates to national characters and structure, while DisplayName is related to how it should appear in UIs, with no restriction other than the user's wishes.			
5	TL	740	ge	The open issue displayName and its relationship to cn and possibly nickname is not trivial. - I view cn as a more formal name, but the sequence of first middle and last is culturally dependent. Some areas do first middle last, others do last first middle and so on. - DisplayName is questionable since requirements might vary depending on the application. Just the first name, just the lastname, first letter of firstname and lastname etc. - Nickname is something that should be under change control of	So for me we can postpone displayName and just use cn with unknown semantics. Sorting might provide interesting results.		See ATTR-4

Type: ge=general, te=technical, ed=editorial

Id	Who	Line	Type	Comment (justification for change)	Proposed change by the commentator	Discussion in the policy subtask	Resolution by the policy subtask
				the end user. Not many IdPs support well defined user change control on attribute values...			
6	DL	749	ge	While I acknowledge that the text describing the vocabularies for eduPersonAffiliation are product of a long discussion and (rough) consensus, I'd like to stress the fact that the current version does not provide a way to identify members of an organization not being faculty or students		vc 14.9: adding that causes confusion	No changes done.
7	TL	767	ge	The international vocabulary for schacHomeOrganizationType attribute is still rudimentary as no textual descriptions exists which would limit the scope open for potential interpretation...		Unfortunately, despite the vc in summer, TERENA hasn't finished SchacHomeOrgtanizationType work and updated http://www.terena.org/registry/terena.org/schac/homeOrganizationType/index.html	Fixing this is not up to eduGAIN project. Continue pushing TERENA...
8	AS	773	ge		Should be specified how SP signal in metadata that it needs a persistent identifier.	This follows from SAML2int.org ver 0.2	No changes done.

Type: ge=general, te=technical, ed=editorial